

Garnaut's claims are incorrect (Letter published in AFR, 2 June 2011. *Note that Letters Ed combined two letters submitted to AFR*)

Every now and again society is subjected to warnings that life cannot continue the way it is. In the 1970s we had a spate of warnings by experts that our survival required that economic and population growth be stopped lest resources expire.

Experts providing such advice included Paul Ehrlich, the Club of Rome and numerous members of the Royal Society.

Fortunately, these dreamers were largely ignored.

Today we have another round of warnings, but this time the experts say the world will end unless we stop emitting carbon dioxide. Even former economic rationalist Ross Garnaut says the science behind this is now beyond reasonable doubt and hence we can be ruled by a committee of experts.

To confirm his view Garnaut sought "expert" statistical advice and this told him the downward trend in temperatures since 2001 was part of a significant warming trend, which did "not end in 1998 or in any other year". A bit like the evidence used by Ehrlich to conclude in 1971 that massive famines will occur soon?

Garnaut's latest review, published [on Tuesday], starts in similar fashion by making two claims that are clearly incorrect – that "the" science has been subjected to intense scrutiny but its credibility is intact and that "expert" statistical analysis (note that this is not by Garnaut) concludes that there is a significant warming trend, which did "not end in 1998 or in any other year".

These incorrect claims led Garnaut to change his view from the science being right on "the balance of probabilities" to now being "beyond reasonable doubt".

These clearly political conclusions might be said to be wrong beyond reasonable doubt.

Des Moore

Director

Institute for Private Enterprise

South Yarra Vic

Letter published in The Australian, 2 June 2011

Every now and again society is subjected to warnings that life cannot continue the way it is. In the 1970s we had a spate of warnings by experts that our survival required that economic and population growth be stopped lest resources expire. Experts providing such advice included Paul Ehrlich, the Club of Rome and numerous members of the Royal Society.

Fortunately, these dreamers were largely ignored.

Today we have another round of warnings, but this time the experts say the world will end unless we stop emitting carbon dioxide. Former economic rationalist, Ross Garnaut, says the science behind this is now beyond reasonable doubt and hence we can be ruled by a committee of experts. To confirm his view Garnaut sought "expert" statistical advice and this told him the downward trend in temperatures since 2001 is actually part of a significant warming trend which did "not end in 1998 or in any other year".

A bit like the evidence used by Ehrlich to conclude in 1971 that massive famines will occur soon?

Des Moore South Yarra Vic

Garnaut latest "review" published yesterday starts in similar fashion by making two claims that are clearly incorrect – that "the" science has been subjected to intense scrutiny but its credibility is intact and that "expert" statistical analysis (note that this is not by Garnaut) concludes that there is a significant warming trend which did "not end in 1998 or in any other year". These incorrect claims lead Garnaut to change his view from "the science" being right on "the balance of probabilities" to now being "beyond reasonable doubt". These clearly political conclusions might be said to be wrong beyond reasonable doubt.